

No. Z. 28015/91/2011-H (Part-1)/MH 2  
Government of India  
Ministry of Health and Family Welfare

Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi.  
Dated: 19<sup>th</sup> April 2016

**MINUTES OF MEETING**

The minutes of 8<sup>th</sup> meeting of National Council for Clinical Establishments held under the Chairmanship of Dr. Jagdish Prasad, DGHS on 21<sup>st</sup> March 2016 at Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi are enclosed for information and necessary action.

Action Taken Report may please be sent in due course to Dr. Anil Kumar, CMO (AK), Room No. 560 - A, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi-110108 or to his email id dr.anilkumar@ncc.in

  
(Sh. K.L. Sharma)

Secretary, National Council for Clinical Establishments and  
Joint Secretary to the Government of India

To

1. All participants including members of National Council as per the list annexed.
2. Other Members of the National Council for Clinical Establishments
  - (i). Dr. B.D. Athani, Special DGHS
  - (ii). Chief Secretary, Government of Andhra Pradesh, Hyderabad
  - (iii). Chief secretary, Government of Maharashtra, Mumbai
  - (iv). President , Medical Council of India, Pocket 14, Sector 8, Dwarka, New Delhi- 77
  - (v). Dr. D.C. Katoch, Joint Advisor, Ministry of AYUSH, New Delhi
  - (vi). Dr. Vanithamuralikumar, Vice President (Ayur.), Central Council of Indian Medicine (CCIM)
  - (vii). Vice-President (Siddha), Principal, Santhigiri Siddha Medical College, Thiruvananthapuram
  - (viii). Dr. Rashidullah Khan, Vice President, Unani, CCIM
  - (ix). Principal, College of Pharmacy, Sri Rama Krishna Institute of Paramedical Sciences, 395 Sarojini Naidu Road, Coimbatore, Tamil Nadu-641044
  - (x). Advisor (Planning), North Eastern Council, Shillong-793003
  - (xi). Advisor (Health), North Eastern Council, Shillong-793003
  - (xii). Dr. Mira Shiva, Consumer Education and Research Centre, New Delhi
  - (xiii). Sh. Ashim Sanyal, Voice Society, O-45, Lajpat Nagar II, Ring Road, New Delhi
3. Sh. Rajesh Narwal, Technical Officer, Health system, WHO- India
4. Chairman and Member Secretary, State council for Clinical Establishments, of the 16 States / Union Territories implementing Clinical Establishments Act namely States of Arunachal Pradesh, Himachal Pradesh, Sikkim, Mizoram, Bihar, Jharkhand, Rajasthan, Uttar Pradesh, Uttarakhand and Assam and Union Territories of Puducherry, Chandigarh, Dadra and Nagar Haveli, Daman and Diu, Andaman and Nicobar, Lakshadweep.

Copy for information to-

- 1) Secretary, Medical Council of India
- 2) Secretary, Dental Council of India
- 3) Registrar-cum-Secretary, Central Council for Indian Medicine
- 4) Secretary, Indian Nursing Council
- 5) Secretary, Central Council of Homoeopathy
- 6) PPS to DGHS
- 7) PPS to JS (KLS)

**SUBJECT: MINUTES OF THE 8<sup>TH</sup> MEETING NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR CLINICAL ESTABLISHMENTS HELD UNDER THE CHAIRMANSHIP OF DR. JAGDISH PRASAD, DGHS ON 21.3.2016 AT 1400 HRS IN THE RESOURCE CENTRE, ROOM NO. 445 A WING, NIRMAN BHAWAN, NEW DELHI.**

The list of participants is annexed.

2. After welcome and introduction by Joint Secretary (KLS) and Secretary, National Council for Clinical Establishments, the agenda items were taken up for discussion/consideration.

3. In the context of item relating to confirmation of Minutes of the last meeting, the IMA representatives pointed out that as per discussion in the last meeting, a meeting was required to be held with DGHS for discussing a few points raised by them relating to provisions of the Act and Rules. However, this has not been reflected in the Minutes. After discussion, it was agreed that the Minutes will be corrected to that extent. With this modification, the minutes of the meeting were confirmed. It was also agreed that a meeting will be scheduled between the IMA representatives and DGHS at a mutually convenient date and time.

3. As regards amendment to the Act and the Rules, Secretary, National Council for Clinical Establishments clarified that these issues are already being examined by an Inter-Ministerial Committee and these needed to be discussed and sorted out at Government level and, therefore, these need not be discussed at this forum.

4. CMO (AK) thereafter made a brief presentation on Action taken on the Minutes of last meeting. He informed that:

- (i) The approved categorization of Clinical establishments was submitted to the Ministry for approval. It has been observed by the Ministry that categorization should not be based on location and ownership of clinical establishments as the National Council has not defined standards based on these parameters. It has also been suggested that instead of Allied Health Professionals, the term "other health care system" may be used. The National Council decided that the issues may be discussed and sorted out;

- (ii) The list of procedures and costing template for calculating the standard procedure cost has also been finalised;
- (ii) As agreed during last meeting, Dr. Ramjee Singh, Member representative of the Central Council of Homoeopathy handed over a corrected draft of minimum standard of Homoeopathy, which has also been forwarded by Secretary of the Central Council of Homoeopathy;
- (iv) After last meeting of the National Council, three more Advocacy cum training workshops have been organised in three States/UTs namely Sikkim, Puducherry and Dadra and Nagar Haveli;
- (v) A total of 7 States/UTs have started online registration so far;
- (vi) A total of 8258 clinical establishments have registered online and 1268 have registered offline so far;
- (vii) A Task Force has been constituted by the Ministry for drafting standard treatment guidelines on areas not already covered under the Clinical Establishments Act. Draft Standard treatment guidelines on Snake Bite, Diabetic Foot and Alcoholic dependence have been developed by the Tasks Force which are available on the website for public comments;
- (viii) Qualification of person incharge has been added in drop down menu so as to prevent registration by unqualified persons; and
- (ix) Permanent registration module has been developed and uploaded on Training Website <http://www.clinicalestablishmentstraining.nic.in> As per provisions of the Act, National Council is mandated to do certain functions including prescribing standards of proper healthcare and this work is to be completed in a time bound manner.

5. As regards commencing permanent registration in States, the Chairman stated that whichever State is satisfied that provisional registration has been completed in that State, they can start permanent registration as the minimum standards have already been approved by the National Council.

6. Dr. Kumar Rajan, representative of the Indian Dental Association (IDA) informed that majority of dental establishments are single establishments and

issues like standards and costing of dental procedures are important for dental practitioners also. The cost of investment, infection control, patient safety in dental procedures and consumables is high in dental practice and should be taken into account so that a rational cost can be arrived Act. It was informed that IDA would be interested in getting involved in the minimum standards for dental clinical establishments. CMO (AK) informed that IDA has been consulted and their inputs taken into consideration while drafting the minimum standards for Dental Clinical Establishments.

7. Thereafter, the representatives of the State Councils of following states made presentation on the status of implementation of the Act and issues if any. The brief facts brought out during the presentation are summarised as under:

**A. Dadra and Nagar Haveli**

1. Clinical Establishments Act has been operationalised;
2. One Union Territory Coordinator and two Data Entry Operators are in place;
3. Online registration has been started after Training workshop; and
4. 128 clinical establishments have been registered so far.

**B. Puducherry**

1. Clinical Establishments Act has been Operationalised;
2. 116 clinical establishments have been registered so far; and
3. Online registration is yet to start although training has been implemented.

**C. Himachal Pradesh**

1. Manpower and implementing infrastructure has been put in place; and
2. Action has been taken to cancel registration of Clinical Establishments run by unqualified persons.

**D. Arunachal Pradesh**

1. The Clinical Establishments Act (CEA) has been operationalised; however online registration could be not started due to frequent power failures with no backup system and poor network connectivity.
2. 455 clinical establishments have been registered so far through offline mode.

3. State Council for Clinical Establishments has appealed that there is no provision in the CEA for punishment of wrong doers except imposition of monetary penalty. In this context, it was informed by Sh. Sunil Nandraj, Advisor that regulation under CEA is based on compliance to Minimum Standards and the District Registering Authority (DRA) has powers to cancel registration and also immediately restrain a Clinical Establishment from practice if there is any imminent danger.

#### **E. Sikkim**

1. Sikkim may start permanent registration immediately as the minimum standards have already been approved by the National Council;
2. Amendment of District Registering Authority (DRA) as per Government of India notification is under process;
3. The minimum standards for Physiotherapy centres have already been approved by the National Council and the State/UT Government may decide the rates of Medical procedures and services based on the costing template and list of procedures already approved by the National Council.
4. As regards registration of clinics run by doctors who are in the employment of Government and have opted out of Non-Practising Allowance (NPA), it was indicated that it is an issue specific to the States where Government doctors are allowed to do private practice. It was agreed that, *prima facie*, if they are running an establishment, it would be registered.

#### **F. Uttar Pradesh**

1. The Rules have been finalised by the Directorate of Health Services and submitted to the Government for notification; and
2. In the above context, the National Council noted that the State Government of Uttar Pradesh has not notified rules for implementing the Clinical Establishments Act despite adopting it in 2011. The National Council desired that the matter may be taken up by the Government of India with the Government of Uttar Pradesh for early notification of rules and implementation of the Act also mentioning that the matter is under examination by the Rajya Sabha.

#### **G. Uttrakhand**

Rules have been prepared and notified; however, implementation of the Rules is still slow. Further, the State Government is also considering revising the rules.

#### **H. Assam**

1. State has adopted the Clinical Establishment Act.
2. The representative of Assam was requested to expedite framing of State rules, their Notification and Notification of State Council and District Registering Authority and proceed with starting provisional registration immediately. It was also informed that the model rules for the purpose are already available and could be adopted by the State Government.

#### **I. Andaman and Nicobar Islands**

The state has already started online registration and is not facing any issues in implementation.

#### **8. After deliberations, the following decisions were taken and action points were recommended:**

- (i). It was agreed that the objections of IMA related to Clinical Establishments Act and Rules thereunder will be discussed separately in a meeting under the Chairmanship of DGHS and it was noted that these are also being discussed at other *fora* and, these need, not therefore, require discussion in the National Council
- (ii). All the States that have completed provisional registration of majority of clinical establishments within their States may be requested to start permanent registration immediately as the minimum standards have already been approved by the National Council.
- (iii). The members and participants including those representing the States /UTs are to send comments and suggestions, if any, on the draft operational guidelines and the permanent registration module available on training website within next 15 days.
- (iv). All States/UTs can be requested to determine the standard procedure cost based on the template of costing and choosing the procedure from the list of procedures already approved by the National Council for Clinical Establishments and circulated to the

members and States/UTs and also included in the operational guidelines. It was decided that these may be placed in public domain for knowledge and information of stakeholders.

- (v). Indian Dental association representative was requested to provide draft of the Standard Treatment Guidelines for Dental Procedures in consultation with all stakeholders.
  - (vi). Other Systems under AYUSH may also provide Standard Treatment Guidelines for common medical conditions. Right now, only Ayurveda STGs have been provided by the Department of AYUSH. The Ministry of AYUSH may be requested to coordinate this work.
  - (vii). The State/UT representatives were requested to expedite implementation of the Clinical establishments Act in their State/UT and ensure that the required budget is included in the NHM PIP for 2016-2017
  - (viii). It is proposed to start online payment gateway for payment of fee, penalties, etc. States were requested to provide details of bank accounts to which payments related to clinical establishments Act are to be made as per the mandate form already circulated.
  - (ix). District Registering Authority (DRA) is advised to use digital signature for approval, as it is a key activity.
  - (x). The corrected draft of minimum standard of Homoeopathy as handed over by Dr. Ramjee Singh and forwarded by Secretary CCH was accepted and approved by the National Council. However, it will be subject to any correction/ objection from Ministry of AYUSH.
  - (xi). National Council members were requested to provide suggestions regarding more categories of clinical establishments for which minimum standards need to be drafted.
  - (xii). The State/UT representatives were requested to organize Continuing Medical Education Programs for Health Care Personnel both from the Government and Private sectors. It was decided that they may take help of professional medical associations for this.
  - (xiii). The National Council desired that the matter of non-framing of rules and implementation of Clinical Establishments Act may be taken up with the Government of UP for expediting the same.
9. The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to and from the chair.

**List of Participants:**

**8<sup>th</sup> Meeting of National Council for Clinical Establishments held under the chairmanship of  
Dr. Jagdish Prasad, DGHS on 21-03-2016 at Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi**

S.No.	Name with Designation	Address	Telephone No/fax No/ Mobile No.	E. mail
<b>National Council Chairman, Members and Secretary</b>				
1.	Dr Jagdish Prasad, DGHS and Chairman of National Council	Dte.GHS, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi	23061063	dghs@nic.in
2.	Shri K L Sharma, Joint Secretary & Secretary National Council	MOHFW, Nirman Bhawan New Delhi	23062426	kl.sharma58@nic.in
3.	Shri Sempal, Sc.'F'	Bureau of Indian Standards, New Delhi	9999446042	<a href="mailto:sempal@bis.org.in">sempal@bis.org.in</a> , <a href="mailto:mhd@bis.org.in">mhd@bis.org.in</a>
4.	Shri B K Rana, Joint Director, QCI	QCI	9899548050	bkrana@nabh.co
5.	Dr. Ramjee Singh President C C H, New Delhi	CCH Office	09334102797	<a href="mailto:dr.ramjeesingh@rediffmail.com">dr.ramjeesingh@rediffmail.com</a>
6.	Dr.K.Reddemma, INC Nominee Nodal Officer	St John College of Nursing Sarjapur Road Bangalore-560034	09886068164	<a href="mailto:reddemma@rediffmail.com">reddemma@rediffmail.com</a>
7.	Dr. D.R. Rai, Past HSG, IMA	Past Hon.Secretary General, IMA HQ, N. Delhi	9312504480	<a href="mailto:dr.drrao@gmail.com">dr.drrao@gmail.com</a>
8.	Dr B Muthukumar, Siddha, Member-Central Council of Indian Medicine CCIM	Janak Puri, New Delhi	9443136448/ 9600035447	muthuclinical@gmail.com
9.	Dr Prasanna N Rao, Member- Ayurveda, Central Council of Indian Medicine CCIM Rep. President	Principal SDM College of Ayurveda, Hasan, Central Council of Indian Medicine	9448064277	profnpnrao@gmail.com
10.	Dr Ramesh Babu Devalla, Ayurveda, Member-CCIM,	Maharashtra	9422141319	<a href="mailto:rbdmgims@gmail.com">rbdmgims@gmail.com</a>
<b>Ministry /DteGHS/NIC</b>				
1.	Dr N S Dharmshaktu, Spl. DG	Dte.GHS, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi	23062193	nsdharmshaktu@yahoo.com
2.	Dr. Sudhir Gupta, Addl DDG	Dte.GHS, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi	23061980	drsudhirgupta@gmail.com
3.	Sh. H. K. Handa, Director	MOHFW, Nirman Bhawan	9810511121	hk.handa@gov.in
4.	Dr Anil Kumar, CMO	Dte.GHS, Nirman Bhawan,	23061459	dr.anilkumar@nic.in
5.	Sh. Bhuvnesh Mishra,SSA	NIC-146 A Nirman Bhawan	9717665353	mishra.b@nic.in

6.	Sh Sunil Kumar, U S	MoHFW, Nirman Bhawan	23061436	sunil.kumar20@gov.in
<b>Other Central regulatory Council representatives</b>				
1.	Ms Archana Mudgal, Registrar cum Secretary	Pharmacy Council of India, New Delhi	9868996524	pci@ndb.vsnl.net.in
2.	Ms Prabha Rani Chawla, Policy Head	Pharmacy Council of India New Delhi	23239184 /23231348	pci@ndb.vsnl.net.in
<b>State Council Members/ Representatives</b>				
1.	Shri T. Lollen, DDHS(PH) cum State Nodal Officer	Directorate of Health Services, Arunachal Pradesh	9436054311	noceaap@gmail.com
2.	Dr. T. Kumaravel, State Nodal Officer, CEA,	Puducherry	9443202831	Ddph2011@gmail.com
3.	Dr. Uttam Pradhan, DHS	Department of Health and FW, Govt. of Sikkim	9434235434	Dr_uttamp@yahoo.co.in
4.	Dr Rakesh Kumar, officer on special duty-DHSR	Directorate of Health Services, Shimla, Himachal Pradesh	9418028012	rakeshsmisml@yahoo.in
5.	Dr Jigna Patel, State Coordinator, CEA	2 <sup>nd</sup> Floor, CMO Office, DMHS, UT of Dadra & Nagar Haveli	9904300022	svbch.sil@gmail.com
6.	Dr Amitabha De, Nodal Officer. CEA	Directorate of Health Services, Andaman & Nicobar Islands	9434271941	dramitabha@gmail.com
7.	Dr N Lalsim, Addl. Director of Health Service, Assam	Officer of the DHS, Assam, Guhawati	9435077354	directorhealthassam@yahoo.co.in
8.	Dr Suman Arya, Joint Director	DGHS, Uttarakhand	7500111160	admcuttarakhand@gmail.com
9.	Dr Badri Vishal, Addl. Director	DGHS, Uttar Pradesh	9415461731	<a href="mailto:badreevishaal@gmail.com">badreevishaal@gmail.com</a> , director.medical.care.up@gmail.com
<b>Other Participants</b>				
1.	Dr K K Aggarwal, HSG	HSG IMA, New Delhi	9811090208	hsg.ima@gmail.com
2.	Dr S S Agarwal	President IMA, B 202 Rejendra Marg Bapu Nagar Jaipur	9811090206	swasthyajp1@gmail.com
3.	Dr Harish Gupta, Joint Secretary, IMA	Yaossi, West Patpar Ganj, Delhi	9810219482	Harishgupta124@gmail.com
4.	Sh Sunil Nandraj	Advisor (CEA) MOHFW	9811419292	sunil.nandraj@gmail.com
5.	Dr Kumar Rajan, Director & Chief Consultant (IDA)	A2/35, Safdarjung Enclave, New Delhi	9868004567	drkumarrajan@outlook.com
6.	Sh. Prashanth KS, Sr. Consultant(PHA)	NHSRC, NIHFW, New Delhi	9310353647	prasanth.mph@gmail.com
7.	SO and Staff of MH2 and MS Section	MOHFW	23061468 23061313	
<b>National Council Secretariat (specific staff)</b>				
1.	Dilip Kumar Consultant (IT)	Room No-647-A, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi	9968045059	dilip.yours@gmail.com
2.	Mrs. Anuradha Statistical Assistant	Room No-647-A, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi	9654638860	anusharma.ani@gmail.com